Implementing Milestones:  
**Historical Context, Competency-Based Medical Education, and Outcomes**  
April 2, 2012, 1:00 pm - 2:45 pm  
Felix Ankel, MD, Michael Beeson, MD, and Patrick Brunett, MD

Goals: To understand the development and purpose of the ACGME Milestone Project, how to incorporate developmental milestones into EM residency, and effective tools for measuring achievement of milestones.

Objectives: Participants will be able to:
1. Describe the ACGME milestone project to faculty and residents.
2. Develop milestones for emergency medicine residents based on the six ACGME core competencies.
3. Create rubrics to measure desired outcomes.
4. Incorporate milestones into progressive responsibility and supervision policies.

1. **HISTORICAL CONTEXT**

   - 1981 ACGME founded
     "The Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education is a private, nonprofit council that evaluates and accredits residency programs in the United States. The ACGME was established from a consensus in the academic medical community for an independent accrediting organization. Its forerunner was the Liaison Committee for Graduate Medical Education, established in 1972. The mission of the ACGME is to improve health care by assessing and advancing the quality of resident physicians' education through exemplary accreditation.”

     [www.acgme.org](http://www.acgme.org)

   - 1986 COGME formed by public law 92-463
     “The Council on Graduate Medical Education (COGME) provides an ongoing assessment of physician workforce trends, training issues and financing policies, and recommends appropriate federal and private sector efforts on these issues. COGME advises and makes recommendations to the Secretary of the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and to the Senate Committee on Health, Education, Labor and Pensions, and the House of Representatives Committee on Energy and Commerce”


   - 1986 Hubert and Stuart Dreyfus publish Mind over Machine. They describe five levels of skill acquisition: Novice, beginner, competent, proficient, expert. Skill acquisition associated with autonomy, coping with complexity, and perception of context.


     [http://www.sld.demon.co.uk/dreyfus.pdf](http://www.sld.demon.co.uk/dreyfus.pdf)

   - 1990s reports recommend change in current state of GME (COGME, Pew Health Professions Commission, AAMC, Federated Council of Internal Medicine, Association of Program Directors of Surgery, Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Canada).

     Batalden P, Leach D, Swing S, Dreyfus H, Dreyfus S. General competencies and accreditation in graduate medical education. *Health Aff (Millwood)*. 2002;21(5):103-111
1994 ACGME internal review of GME process. Move to outcomes process.

1999 ACGME board approves 6 core competencies


2012 ACGME Next Accreditation System (NAS). Consists of milestones (5 levels (Dreyfus and Dreyfus), resident and faculty surveys.


2. COMPETENCY-BASED MEDICAL EDUCATION (CBME)

- Valid and reliable assessment tools such as direct observation, formative feedback, learner self-directed assessment; involvement of learner in educational process; faculty development focused on curricular design and competency assessment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1. A comparison of the elements of structure- and process-based versus competency-based educational programs.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Educational program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure- and process-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competency-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Driving force for curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content—knowledge acquisition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcome—knowledge acquisition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Driving force for process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Path of learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hierarchical (teacher → student)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-hierarchical (teacher → student)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsibility for content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student and teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal of educational encounter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge acquisition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Typical assessment tool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single subjective measure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple objective measures (&quot;evaluation portfolio&quot;)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment tool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proxy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authentic (&quot;micro real tasks of profession&quot;)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setting for evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Removed (gestalt)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;In the trenches&quot; (direct observation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm-referenced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criterion-referenced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timing of assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on summative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on formative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program completion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fixed time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable time</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


3. ASSESSMENT

- Measurable and observable performance expectations; level-based with expected time frame for achievement. Includes assessment of Skills, Knowledge and Attitudes (KSA), some specialty-specific, others universal to physicians in training. Narrative anchors of behavior that demonstrate progress toward achievement of the identified benchmarks.

- Assessment is continuous; reporting occurs twice a year. Most residents should meet expectations in advance of the “deadline.” Failure to meet expectations triggers further assessment and possible remediation.
Example from Internal Medicine:


- Pediatrics: “commitment to engage in personal and professional development” (e.g., self-awareness, flexibility, trustworthiness, leadership, self-confidence, healthy response to stressors)

- Optimally done *with*, rather than *to*, the resident. Balance between deconstruction (analysis of microtasks) and reconstruction (integrated, complex performance)


4. EMERGENCY MEDICINE MILESTONES

- EM-specific milestones developed and approved by ABEM BOD and RRC-EM. Working group includes: AACEM, AAEM, ABEM, ACEP, CORD, EMRA, SAEM, RRC-EM, ACGME. Alignment with existing core competencies and ABEM standards. Conceptual link to the “Physician Tasks” section of *Model of Clinical Practice of Emergency Medicine*.

- Includes cognitive and behavioral performance standards, including procedure-based skills. Tightly coincides with KSAs developed by ABEM for Initial Certification.

  - Domains – 6 Core Competencies, plus subcompetencies within each domain; narrative descriptions of essential KSAs.

  - 5 Levels of Proficiency – Performance along a continuum:
Entry level ➔ Expected performance at medical school graduation ➔ Experienced practitioner

- Validity and Feasibility Studies:
  ABEM in conjunction with the ACGME will be conducting a validity study that will look at each of the five levels of proficiency within each Milestone, and whether a large survey group matches the Milestone Working Group’s assignment levels. A second feasibility study will look at the degree of ease/difficulty in the implementation of the Milestone Accreditation System.

- Implementation - The Emergency Medicine Milestone Working Group met March 12, 2012, for a one-day meeting on Assessment related to the Milestones. Assessment will be the single most important factor in the success of the NAS as it pertains to EM. This represents a huge potential involvement by CORD in the development of one or more assessment tools based on accepted methods of evaluation, such as direct observation, simulation, chart review, etc.

5. EM MILESTONES: Approved January 2012 by ABEM BOD, and February 2012 by RRC-EM. A total of 24 milestones, with 6 procedure-based.

- PC1- Emergency Stabilization
- PC2- Performance of Focused History and Physical Exam
- PC3- Diagnostic Studies
- PC4- Diagnosis
- PC5- Pharmacotherapy
- PC6- Observation and Reassessment
- PC7- Disposition
- PC8- Multi-tasking (Task-switching)
- PC9- General Approach to Procedures
- PC10- Airway Management
- PC11- Anesthesia and Acute Pain Management
- PC12- Other Diagnostic and Therapeutic Procedures: Ultrasound (Diagnostic/Procedural)
- PC13- Other Diagnostic and Therapeutic Procedures: Wounds Management
- PC14- Other Diagnostic and Therapeutic Procedures: Vascular Access
- MK- Medical Knowledge
- PROF1- Professional values
- PROF2- Accountability
- ICS1- Patient Centered Communication
- ICS2- Team Management
- PBLI1- Teaching
- PBLI2- Practice Based Performance Improvement
- SBP1- Patient Safety
- SBP2- Systems-based Management
REFERENCES


